



Approved Minutes  
**Historic Preservation Board**

(Approved on August 28, 2014. Motion made by Mack-Allred and seconded by Schaffer-Metcalf)

**Date:** July 24, 2014

**Time:** 6:00 p.m.

**Location:** 57 E. First Street, Lower Level Council Chambers

Members Present	Members Absent	Staff Present	Guests
Jim Taylor, Chair Wendy Mack-Allred, Vice Chair Bernard Dawson Dane Astle Laura Schaffer-Metcalf Janice Gennevois		John Wesley Kim Steadman Rebecca Gorton	Donna Benge, Resident Haydee Dawson, Resident Cynthia Dunn, West Mesa CDC Jim Gleason, Resident Gary Hashimoto, Architect

**1) Call meeting to order**

Vice Chair Mack-Allred called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.

**2) Introduction of new HPB Members**

Vice Chair Mack-Allred introduced and welcomed new board members Laura Schaffer-Metcalf and Janice Gennevois.

**3) Election of new HPB Officers**

Board member Dawson nominated board member Jim Taylor as Chair, seconded by Vice Chair Mack-Allred.

Motion carried 6-0.

Board member Dawson nominated Vice Chair Mack-Allred as Vice Chair, seconded by Chair Taylor.

Motion carried 6-0.

**4) Approval of the May 22, 2014 minutes**

Board Action: The May 22, 2014 minutes were unanimously approved with amended changes to Item 4a. Replace sentence one from "landmark status" to read as "Historic District Designation".

First Motion made by Board member Schaffer-Metcalf as changed and seconded by Board member Dawson.

Motion carried 6-0.

**5) Discuss and give direction to staff for:**

**a. 254 N. MacDonald – revision to non-conforming porch**

Staff member Kim Steadman presented the request from homeowner James Gleason to revise the roof and front porch to his home at 254 N. MacDonald. The home has been registered as a contributing structure and Mr. Gleason has made application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to make alterations to the structure. The home had previously been altered with the addition of a room on the front of the home and Mr. Gleason's desire is to maintain the historic status of their home by keeping the addition and at the same time updating the exterior. Mr. Steadman contacted the Historic Preservation Officer with the

City of Tempe to discuss the addition and alterations of the home. The opinion of the City of Tempe's HPO is that the home has already lost its Historic status with the additions that had previously been made to the home. Mr. Steadman is requesting that the Board give direction to staff on how the owner can maintain the contributing structure status while making the improvements to the home.

Vice Chair Mack-Allred stated that a survey was conducted in 1992 which showed that the home was not eligible on the historic register, but listed as "contributing". Board member Schaffer-Metcalf confirmed that the year the home was built was 1937 and Mr. Steadman stated this to be correct. There is no record of when the addition was built to the home and since the survey was done in 1992, it was assumed that the addition was built prior to the survey.

Homeowner Mr. Gleason introduced the architect, Mr. Gary Hashimoto of Design Profile Architects. Board member Gennevois asked Mr. Hashimoto if he regularly handles Historic structures, in which he responded that he does not. Mr. Hashimoto stated that he felt the new design is in keeping with the original feel of the home and integrity of the original design. Mr. Gleason asked the board for suggestions on what he can do in order to keep the historic status and still update the home.

Chair Taylor stated his concerns are primarily with the altering of the roof line, a chimney and adding the porch. Chair Taylor read the definition of rehabilitation as defined by the Secretary of Interior. This case is clearly about rehabilitation. One guideline that was discussed is the need to adhere to the appearance of scale. Chair Taylor is very concerned about raising the roof and the chimney because this clearly alters the scale. Chair Taylor then read the definition of scale. He stated that the new drawings significantly alter the scale of the original home which moves the home away from a contributing factor, further stripping the home of its original scale.

Board member Astle asked if they could stay with the original height of the house in which Mr. Gleason responded that the issue they come up against is how to keep the addition of the home and not change scale. The pitch they want to use enhances the front and is in keeping with the elements of the area.

John Wesley stated that what needs to be considered is whether or not it is still a contributing structure. The application is not for action, but to receive direction from the board. It is understood that the owners want to maintain the historic status. Board member Astle stated that he can understand where the owner is going, but it is hard to see the building currently as a historic structure. Mr. Gleason stated he welcomes suggestions as to how to update the home and still maintain the historic relevance. Mr. Wesley stated that the historic designation has been taken away and asked Vice Chair Mack-Allred how the owners would go about receiving any discounts on their taxes. Vice Chair Mack-Allred stated that the owners will need to send in their request to the state and explain how it is still a contributing factor along with photos. Once SHPO receives the information, they will make the determination.

#### **b. 438 N. Grand – replacement of previously replaced windows**

Staff member Kim Steadman presented the Board with an application from homeowners of 438 N. Grand, asking to replace aluminum windows with new vinyl windows. The original windows had previously been replaced with aluminum windows, which from the street appeared as though they were the original wood windows. The new windows redeem the same pattern of the historic element of the aluminum windows. Although the homeowners have already replaced the windows, Mr. Steadman wanted to bring this application to the board for discussion, as we will be processing these applications from time to time. Since the windows had previously been replaced, the historic element has already been lost. Vice Chair Mack-Allred stated that SHPO does not frown on replacing windows as long as they stay with the same style and are more energy efficient. Board member Astle agreed that the efficiency is important. There was discussion as to the reason the shutters were removed. Staff member Steadman stated that the shutters were made of plastic and not original to the home so they were removed.

Chair Taylor stated that as long as they stay with the original size and style, he feels that the homeowner is within the guidelines.

**6) Review and discuss proposed Heritage Neighborhood Recognition Program;**

Mr. John Wesley presented the board with a draft of the proposed Heritage Neighborhood Recognition Program for review. There are several areas within the City limits that have a rich history such as the Washington Park and Lehi areas and this program will provide some tools so that they can be recognized for that history. It can be difficult for some areas to receive a historical district designation as there are vacant lots, new home construction and other changes. In order to recognize these neighborhoods, we wanted to develop another tool for the areas that have a strong cultural history. To help pull them together as a neighborhood, we came up with the Heritage Neighborhood Recognition Program.

The requirements are still being reviewed for what we want to accomplish. One way to recognize the areas is placing signs in the areas. Mr. Wesley introduced Cynthia Dunn from the West Mesa CDC to discuss some of the things they have been working with in the Washington Park neighborhood.

Vice Chair Mack-Allred stated that she loves this idea. Board member Schaffer-Metcalf asked Mr. Wesley if there are examples of this program in other areas. Mr. Wesley stated that he has sent an email to the SHPO office and he has not received a response from them to date. He has researched the internet to see if there are other areas that have instituted this type of program and has not seen any similar programs. Board member Schaffer-Metcalf stated that this could potentially lead to a national program and model for Mesa. Board member Gennevois mentioned that the Washington Park area has many homes where famous people lived which could be recognized as individual homes.

Chair Taylor stated that he has some concerns about the requirements. For instance, he asked if a certain percentage of signatures would be required from the residents that agree to the designation. Perhaps some of the residents would feel the designation would bring more traffic which could be troublesome. He also asked who would be responsible for the signs. Chair Taylor stated that this could be an opportunity for the HPB to get a line item in the budget from the city and if not he asked where the money would come from for the signs. Mr. Wesley responded that this is something we have to take a closer look at with communication and support before it is taken to a council subcommittee. The signs that have been installed in the historic district cost approximately \$40 each and with a post it is around \$150. Unless there are a lot of requests it is not a significant amount of money. Board member Gennevois suggested involving the students to assist in fund raisers as well as sponsorships. Member Gennevois stated she would sponsor a heritage district.

Board member Astle asked if this designation would prohibit anyone from future development or loss of the designation of their own property. Mr. Wesley stated that this is a part of reviewing and finalizing the requirements.

Cynthia Dunn stated that she appreciates all of the comments that have been made. This is a wonderful opportunity to build on the needs of the community and preserve the history of some significant areas in Mesa and assist in bringing people together. John Wesley stated that we will need to take a closer look at the neighborhoods as we move forward and will need a dedicated group of people which will communicate support and financing. John Wesley stated that we will discuss this further at the next meeting as the goal is to take this to a council subcommittee in September.

**7) Discuss and plan for Historic property owner's Open House in the fall**

John Wesley stated that the previous board chair desired to bring the residents of the historic districts together for a social function. The idea was to provide a gathering that would be informative and social so that the owners could better understand the benefits of being a part of the historic district. After speaking

with the previous chair, John Wesley met with Cynthia Dunn of the West Mesa Community Development Corporation and discovered that they are planning on putting together a similar community meeting. This would provide a good opportunity to combine the Open House idea for Historic property owner's with the community meeting.

Ms. Dunn stated that the CDC found that there was a need to have a community conversation on housing in general and the Historic Preservation is an important part of that piece. Chair Taylor stated that he sees a need to promote Mesa's Historic Preservation Board and would like to see more public promotion, walking tours, promotional materials, etc. in the coming year. He stated that the community meeting could be a jump start to bring attention to the HPB. Ms. Dunn stated that although the CDC is named West Mesa CDC, they provide services throughout Mesa. The CDC just contracted for neighborhood meetings on the east and west side for the next year and this would be a great place to share information about the HPB.

**8) Discuss status of efforts to establish historic district(s) or landmark(s) for:**

Mr. John Wesley stated that the following items have been on the agenda each month as we did not want to forget these projects. The previous chair had been concerned about the lack of receiving grants and so Mr. Wesley met with the staff grant administrator and found that one was available to apply for immediately.

There was a discussion to remove some of the following for the next meeting:

- a. 2<sup>nd</sup> Avenue and Pasadena**
- b. Washington Park-Escobedo**
- c. Downtown**
- d. Westside/Clark**
- e. Sherwood**
- f. Buckhorn Baths**
- g. Federal Building**

**9) View City of Mesa Community Annual Report**

John Wesley presented to the board the City Manager's website and demonstrated how to navigate to the Community Annual Report. The Annual Report links a video clip to each district Council member with updates and events occurring in their district.

**10) Update on the historic highway signage for former US Highways 60, 70, 80, and 89 on Main Street**

There is no update.

**11) Update on the proposed Interpretive Historic Panels – Light Rail Stations**

There is no update.

**12) Discussion of opportunities for involving students in historic preservation**

There is no update at this time. Previous board member Dahlke will be sharing updates at the August meeting. As an Administrator for one of the public school districts, Board member Schaffer-Metcalf stated that they have a classroom that participates in active service learning programs with the students. This would be a good opportunity to bring this to the attention of the school superintendent as he is looking for local opportunities for the students to participate in. Board member Schaffer-Metcalf will provide updates during the upcoming school year.

### **13) Updates on Museums, Exhibits, Committees and Events related to Historic Preservation**

Vice Chair Mack-Allred discussed the recent conference that several of the board members attended last month. She enjoyed the conference, attending workshops on writing grant proposals, understanding historic content and benefits of hiring contractors. She also enjoyed attending a tour of the districts in Nogales. Chair James Taylor also attended and felt it was an amazing opportunity and got a lot out of the workshops he chose to attend. He found the case study of downtown Florence informative and interesting. Chair Taylor made a point of meeting new people and opening up discussions. Chair Taylor recommended this conference for anyone able to attend.

Vice Chair Mack-Allred stated that she attended the Pioneer Park/Temple neighborhood open house on June 24 at the library. City Staff, members of the Light Rail, the Mayor, Urban Garden members as well as John Wesley were there. There were discussions of future plans for the neighborhood and was very informative.

### **14) Board Member comments, questions, and future agenda items**

The Annual report will be finalized with the change from Board Member Michelle Dahlke to Dane Astle and will then be sent to the SHPO office.

Board member Schaffer-Metcalf stated that she has experience with grant writing and would be happy to assist when she can.

### **15) Adjournment**

Vice Chair Mack-Allred adjourned the meeting at 7:38 pm.

First motion made by Board member Dawson, and seconded by Chair Taylor.  
Motion carried 6-0.

Supporting data is available for public review in the Planning Division,  
Municipal Building, 55 N. Center St., Mesa, Arizona 85201

The City of Mesa is committed to making its public meetings accessible to persons with disabilities. For special accommodations, please contact the Neighborhood Services Administration Office at 644-2387 or 644-2778 (TDD) at least 48 hours in advance of the meeting.  
Para asistencia en Español, llamar (480) 644-5597.